"Context. Context. Context," is my oft repeated advice to my research students. What we say and what it means depends significantly on where, when and how we say it. But of course sometimes there are absolutes. So let’s get one thing clear, Mulayam Singh Yadav (MSY) and friends, rape is not a "mistake", it is a crime and should be punished.

However, I along with many, (though by no means all), feminists, am against the death penalty. I would also argue that awarding the death penalty to lower-class men in no way addresses the rape culture in India. So does this mean I agree with MSY?

There is a case for context here too. People seem very confused about what feminists want. And this may be because we are often making nuanced arguments about all kinds of things, but in the present context (that lovely word again), about rape cultures, patriarchal ideologies and systems of justice.

The feminist position is not against punishing the perpetrators, but against the state arrogating to itself the right to kill. We argue that the certainty of punishment is a far greater deterrent than its severity. Further, as was seen in the Shakti Mills case, the death penalty is often awarded by making the "rape is a fate worse than death", "the victim is rendered a zinda laash", kind of arguments that are built around patriarchal notions of honour and in fact co-exist quite happily with rape cultures where everyday forms of sexual harassment and assault are brushed aside in precisely the kind of "boys will be boys" argument that MSY is making, in relation to rape.

Statistical data from across the world demonstrates that men from poor and minority communities make up a disproportionate per cent of death row prisoners. The media reportage of the December 16, 2012, Delhi gang rape as well as the Shakti Mills gang rapes focused relentlessly on the deprived backgrounds of the perpetrators, intentionally or unintentionally, making the case that it is lower-class, and often “footloose migrant” men who are the rapists. This often has the effect of obscuring the fact that rapists are in the majority of cases known to their victims and are often neighbours or kin and also of completely erasing the middle and upper class perpetrators of rape. But more on this anon.

The feminist position then, while against the death penalty and aware of the marginal location of poor men, is quite different from that of MSY and his ilk. Unlike the Abu Azmis and sundry khaps of this country, feminists assert women’s right to consent (both within and outside of marriage) and to make choices about our bodies. We reject the offers of conditional safety and demand our right to public space.

The recent comments of MSY and Abu Azmi have the media shrilly baying for their blood and the Right and Left alike denouncing them on various social media. In a similar vein have been comments such as those of Asaram Bapu (himself a rape accused) who counselled that the young physiotherapist could have saved herself if she had called the men her brothers. Khap panchayat member, Jitendar Chattar averred (perfectly seriously) that such acts are caused by the consumption of chowmein which creates ‘hormonal imbalance’. Not to be outdone, Nanki Ram Kanwar, Chhattisgarh home minister, argued that the alignment of the stars were to blame for the crime. These assertions are rivalled only by the calls for the policing of women's
clothing, the denial of cell phones to women and the calls for women to willingly consent to house arrest, ostensibly in order to stay safe. These constitute in some ways the almost lunatic fringe of the spectrum. I write, 'almost' because unfortunately they are far from few in number. Yet, public debate even in the mainstream media counters them unequivocally.

Far more dangerous, I would argue, are the other voices — the ones that masquerade as progressive. Recently, journalists Manu Joseph and separately, Seema Mustafa wrote articles calling into question the testimony of the Tejpal assault survivor. It is important to mention here that these articles are based on the viewing of CCTV footage that, as per court guidelines, should not have been accessible to them at all.

Joseph under the aim of writing the balanced story jeopardizes the identity of the survivor and succeeds in creating reasonable doubt about the survivor testimony. Mustafa goes a step further and in her concluding lines, argues that the CCTV footage suggests that there was no apparent force that propelled her (the survivor) to enter the lift. Her final words are, "The jury is clearly out on this one".

There was a strong negative response to these articles that accused them of being part of a campaign to discredit the survivor. The Network of Women in the Media wrote to the Press Council of India and the Editors’ Guild of India contending that these pieces were against journalistic ethics, were biased against the complainant and could be seen as part of a deliberate attempt to influence the case. In response, Seema Mustafa hit out at feminists for what she perceived was an intolerance to "differing views".

The challenge for feminists then is not just to counter the ludicrous comments of the politicians but to place them alongside those who seem to be making ‘reasoned’ arguments. Yes it is important to counter the ridiculous misogyny of MSY, but many would rush to agree that certainly these deprived/depraved young men deserve punishment. It is however harder, but just as important, to counter those voices that protect the privilege of the Tarun Tejpals of this world. Ultimately, MSY sympathizing with the perpetrators of the Shaki Mills gang rapes and the victim-blaming engaged in by journalists (among others) in relation to the Tejpal case are part of the same context where if women are attacked, it must be because we asked for it. These and others like them must all be seen and countered as part a spectrum of attacks which are attempting to silence women’s voices and capacities to defend ourselves and seek justice.

*The writer is co-author of Why Loiter? Women and Risk on Mumbai Streets*
Julio Ribeiro: Preparing for 'Ghar Wapsi'

Soaring expectations
Politics of conversion

Tactic of intimidation
Virat Kohli: Aussie spirit with an Indian heart
Steve Smith swats away India with fantastic 133 in Brisbane test
A rewind to Steve Smith’s glorious 162 at Adelaide

6 Comments

DNA India
Login

Sort by Oldest
Share

Join the discussion…

•
Reply

teertharam
•
8 months ago

Asaramji Bapu ne Delhi gangrape ke bare me jaisa kaha tha vaisa nahi bataya gaya. Hindustan ko barbad karne ka kam karne wale kuchh bikau media Hindu santo ko badnam karne liye jhoothe news barha charha kar batati hai. Babaji kaha kuchh aur usko vikrit karke dikhaya.

see this link -
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...

•
Reply

rational
•
8 months ago

> 

Mr. teertharam, aap ne jo likha hai, bilkul sahee hai. Aasaram ke khilaaf bebuniyaad ilzaam lage hain.

1

•
Reply

teertharam
•
8 months ago

> 

rational

aaj bhi karodo mahilae hai jo Bapuji se unko jo labh hue hai use yadakar ve bhav vibhor ho jate hai. Bapuji ke bare me jo jhoothe news kai media ne dikhaye usse unke bhakt bahut ahat hue hai. Hindu Santo ki udarta hai jo unke itne karodo bhakt shant hai kisi aur dharma k dharma guru k sath aisa kuchh hota to kya se kya nahi ho jata? Mahilao k liye Bapuji ne jo kiye vo kisi ne nahi kiya. see the link
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...
https://www.youtube.com/watch?...

aur bhi na jane kitne sewa karya Bapuji k prerna se chal rahe the lekin durbhagyvas kuchh asamajik tatvo ko pasand nahi aya..

王子•
8 months ago
BJP chief minister in Delhi will be 'puppet' of centre, says AAP chief …

75 comments • 16 hours ago

Spock — Better to be puppet of center than puppet of Dubai!

Aarop to befuniyaad lagaye gaye hai bapuji ke aap ke saath aur samuchhe bhartyi sanskriti ke khilaaf. Aaj aap dekh hi rahe honge ki kis tarah bharat ki nari apmanit ho ra hai. Aur jo kanoon bana he wo sirf nirdosh logo ko fasane ki sekar banaya gaya hai. Uski bume bapuji ko befuniyaad case me fasaya ja raha hai. Varna medical report aur doctor ke kahne par ye saaf ho raha hai ki ladki ke saath aisa kuch bhi nahi hua hai fir bhi aaj bapuji jai me kyo hai? Ye bhumhi bade sajish hai.

World leaders embrace India | Latest News & …

1 comment • 7 hours ago

P.S.Radhakrishnan — Like India sought a change and got an outstanding, honest, sincere, …

Twitter suffers a partial outage | Latest News & …

2 comments • 4 hours ago

mountain90 — I don't like Twitter. I like Facebook...!!on ap standa, on ap lioa, lioa, on ap

ALSO ON DNA INDIA

'Brazil mission has been a complete failure, both in India and across the world'

4 comments • 7 hours ago

MoronPriest — I am a Syrian Catholic myself, but if I say these things publicly, they will ex-communicate …

EDITOR'S PICKS

INDIA

'Christian mission has been a complete failure, both in India and across the world'

44 Shares • 6 hours ago

ANALYSIS

Section 66A: Nightmare for citizens who dare to dissent

17 Shares • 9 hours ago

INDIA

BJP-PDP alliance may become reality

24 Shares • 6 hours ago
MONEY
On money trail of 2014

INDIA
World leaders embrace India

FLASH VERSION 10,1 OR GREATER IS REQUIRED
You have no flash plugin installed
Download latest version from here

RELATED
Section 66A: Nightmare for citizens who dare to dissent
Policy Watch: Diamonds- Un-make in India
Dubai in the days before it resembled mini-Manhattan
Message in the ballots
PK: Aamir Khan as a popcorn religious experience

TOP STORIES FROM CITIES
Shiv Sena's transport wing to ensure safety of women on 31st
No leads in Rs one lakh Goregaon robbery
TISS launches documentation cell to highlight issues of senior citizens

Travel agent held for duping people of Rs7 lakh

Three homeless persons found dead in Delhi due to cold wave

ACROSS DNA NEWS

Restriction on movement of civilians in Arunachal-Assam border

Uber announces additional safety measures in India in wake of New Delhi rape case

Shiv Sena dares government to capture Dawood Ibrahim in Osama Bin Laden-like operation

Police foil Naxal attack on cell phone tower in Telangana

2014: 11 lakh tourists visited Kashmir despite floods, elections

SPORTS NEWS

Michael Schumacher still long way from full recovery, says legend's manager Sabine Kehm

'Campaign' on to 'influence' refereeing decisions, says Chelsea manager Jose Mourinho

India v/s Australia 3rd Test Day 4, Melbourne: Australia fightback to pile up 261/7, take lead of 326 runs

South Africa can rip through West Indies batting on day four, claims bowling coach Allan Donald

TRENDING TOPICS

Jammu and Kashmir Elections 2014  Omar Abdullah  Narendra Modi  Bodo militants  Aamir Khan  Assam  Taliban  Big boss  Google  Russia  Palestinian  Yemen  Peshawar  India vs Australia

NEWS

US President Barack Obama praises troops as US marks end of war in Afghanistan

Kashmir valley freezes under 'Chillai Kalan'; Kargil coldest

Restriction on movement of civilians in Arunachal-Assam border

AirAsia QZ8501 Live Updates: Australian plane reportedly spots objects in search area

Uber announces additional safety measures in India in wake of New Delhi rape case

SPORT

Michael Schumacher still long way from full recovery, says legend's manager Sabine Kehm

'Campaign' on to 'influence' refereeing decisions, says Chelsea manager Jose Mourinho

India v/s Australia 3rd Test Day 4, Melbourne: Australia fightback to pile up 261/7, take lead of 326 runs

South Africa can rip through West Indies batting on day four, claims bowling coach Allan Donald

Ched Evans case: Rape victim's father claims daughter had to change name and shift hose five times post Twitter trolls

ENTERTAINMENT

‘Furious’ Madonna says ‘no one can shut her up’

Chris Rock, wife to divorce after 19 years of marriage

Bigg Boss 8: Aaj Khan re-enters show as first challenger of new series 'Halla Bol'

Aaron Paul in talks for 'Star Wars VII: The Force Awakens' Han Solo spin-off movie

Celeb chef Jamie Oliver declined Peter Jackson's offer to be hobbit

MONEY

Rupee pares initial losses, still down 7 paise against dollar

Easier entry rules, competitive taxation key to boost manufacturing, says Finance Minister Arun Jaitley

Sensex surges 265 points in early trade on global trends

Rupee extends weakness, down 13 paise against USD

Housing sector could turnaround in 2015 with boost of FDI