Defending Fr Frazer's right to criticise

Friday, 25 April 2014 - 6:05am IST | Place: Mumbai | Agency: dna

Shilpa Phadke

I was a teacher in St Xavier’s College, Mumbai, in 1999-2001, and much to the chagrin of many of us, the then principal defended his stand against sleeveless clothes and the increasingly strict surveillance of any college socials at night, on the grounds that as a "minority institution" they could not afford to anger the conservative powers-that-be. Fr Frazer was then my colleague in the Department of Sociology.

St Xavier’s unfortunately still has a dress code but some things have certainly changed. Since Fr Frazer took over as principal of the college he has taken several principled stands. He vocally opposed the arbitrary dropping of Rohinton Mistry’s Such A Long Journey and the strong arm tactics of the Shiv Sena. He stood by human rights activist and former student of the college, Arun Ferreira, who was in jail on charges of being a Naxalite.

St Xavier’s is a far from perfect institution; it wasn’t perfect when I was a student, or a teacher there and it isn’t perfect now. It was often deeply classist and like other educational institutions, arbitrary in the enforcement of rules. But one thing it always was and is: secular. It was secular when teachers formed groups to carry out relief work in the aftermath of the 1992-93 communal violence and it continues to be secular today.

Today, Fr Frazer has taken a stand against fascism and lopsided development. This is the kind of courageous and forthright college I imagined I was a student and teacher of. Yes, he wrote in his official capacity — and some people think its not quite de rigueur. Some have argued that this is an unacceptable abuse of authority as the head of an institution. Others see it as an impossibly grey and ambiguous area — the act of a Principal writing to students on the eve of an election.

But let’s ask why the BJP is so incensed. Fr Frazer is the head of an institution that has an influential alumni. He is not saying anything other commentators have not already said in stronger words. But Fr Frazer is speaking to the "youth", the voters the BJP desperately want and imagine they will have. And more importantly, Fr Frazer is attacking not the BJP’s communal agenda but rather its so-called development model, the Gujarat model.

Fr Frazer’s email makes a case for why the Gujarat model does not offer any real development, and points to the state’s poor performance on the Human Development Index. Further, he praises some of the schemes of the current government. He ends his email, by writing, “Choose well!” He names no political parties or candidates. He offers no threats. He simply offers his opinion.

This reasoned and reasonable letter is written in a time when hate speech and threats abound. The BJP’s (over) reaction to the letter reflects their complete intolerance to dissent. Remember also that St Xavier’s is a minority institution and doubly vulnerable in a possibly xenophobic environment, which makes Fr Frazer’s willingness to stand up and be counted against fascism doubly courageous.

I have been asked how I would react if the Principal of another college wrote an email supporting the Gujarat model. I would write and speak against his/her view and register my dissent. But I would not for a moment argue against their right to speak and be heard. Let us not forget that all education is political.
Faced with threats, however, empty, of being thrown out of the country if we express dissent or criticism, there is every reason for us to speak and to defend the right of others to speak and write. The fabric of our democracy is at stake.

The writer is Assistant Professor at the Tata Institute of Social Sciences. She is an alumna of St Xavier’s College, Mumbai.
Soaring expectations
Politics of conversion

Tactic of intimidation
Virat Kohli: Aussie spirit with an Indian heart
Steve Smith swats away India with fantastic 133 in Brisbane test.
A rewind to Steve Smith’s glorious 162 at Adelaide

Is used in the case of control and conflict of interest, is very

willfully violating model code of election. He is a snake in the grass just promoting myopic view of a overzealous minority.

sailor  •  8 months ago

The good father has done exactly what the moulvis do in madrasas. Why should there be any partiality. In the process he has also reduced the great institution of St. Xavier to the level of a Madrassa.

Naga Sahay  •  8 months ago

The institution in question is one of the many run by illegitimate progeny of McCaulay. The alumni apparently have had no alternative as all educational institutions were established by the British to serve their colonial interests. We believed that characters like Fraser who brings up the rear of social rejects and renegades, will at least try to be average citizens of the country and keep off from spreading communal poison under whatever garb. Incidentally, the sociology departments in these establishments are basically subversive and platform for proselytization. To claim that they can pronounce judgements on developmental models will therefore, be an insult to intelligence. Note that this cheap clergy given undue powers for communal reasons, should have known that secularism - british coinage - expects the church to keep off matters of state and that christianity has nothing whatever to do with democracy
Perhaps it pains BJP followers to have their god sent model trashed. If Gujarat Model is very good why does not Modi or BJP debate it when leaders from other states like Tamil Nadu have criticised the model? You start doubting the model when voters in the South get freebies due to their habit of asking 'What is in it for me?'. Vague indicators of development in the form of US style GDP numbers won't cut ice. A country exists for its people and not for its elite alone. Gujarat model which rides on capitalism alone will not be acceptable to many and should rightly be criticised. Further, Indian federal structure is designed so that states have more autonomy in all affairs. Remember India is a Union of States like the erstwhile USSR with a common ethnic and cultural brotherhood. Unless each of the states are allowed to handle their disputes on their own the nation could even go to extent of separatism (god forbid).
ANALYSIS

Section 66A: Nightmare for citizens who dare to dissent

INDIA

BJP-PDP alliance may become reality

MONEY

On money trail of 2014

INDIA

World leaders embrace India

RELATED

Section 66A: Nightmare for citizens who dare to dissent

Policy Watch: Diamonds- Un-make in India

Dubai in the days before it resembled mini-Manhattan

Message in the ballots

PK: Aamir Khan as a popcorn religious experience

Most Viewed

PK: Aamir Khan as a popcorn religious experience

Message in the ballots

Inner Truth: What is Love?

Most Shared

PK: Aamir Khan as a popcorn religious experience

Message in the ballots
TOP STORIES FROM CITIES

Shiv Sena's transport wing to ensure safety of women on 31st

No leads in Rs one lakh Goregaon robbery

TISS launches documentation cell to highlight issues of senior citizens

Travel agent held for duping people of Rs7 lakh

Three homeless persons found dead in Delhi due to cold wave

ACROSS DNA NEWS

Restriction on movement of civilians in Arunachal-Assam border

Uber announces additional safety measures in India in wake of New Delhi rape case

Shiv Sena dares government to capture Dawood Ibrahim in Osama Bin Laden-like operation

Police foil Naxal attack on cell phone tower in Telangana

2014: 11 lakh tourists visited Kashmir despite floods, elections

SPORTS NEWS

Michael Schumacher still long way from full recovery, says legend's manager Sabine Kehm

'Campaign' on to 'influence' refereeing decisions, says Chelsea manager Jose Mourinho

India v/s Australia 3rd Test Day 4, Melbourne: Australia fightback to pile up 261/7, take lead of 326 runs

South Africa can rip through West Indies batting on day four, claims bowling coach Allan Donald

TRENDING TOPICS

Jammu and Kashmir Elections 2014  Omar Abdullah  Narendra Modi  Bodo militants  Aamir Khan  Assam  Taliban  Big boss  Google  Russia  Palestinian  Yemen  Peshawar  India vs Australia

NEWS

US President Barack Obama praises troops as US marks end of war in Afghanistan

Kashmir valley freezes under 'Chillai Kalan'; Kargil coldest

Restriction on movement of civilians in Arunachal-Assam border

AirAsia QZ8501 Live Updates: Australian plane reportedly spots objects in search area

Uber announces additional safety measures in India in wake of New Delhi rape case

SPORT

Michael Schumacher still long way from full recovery, says legend's manager Sabine Kehm

'Campaign' on to 'influence' refereeing decisions, says Chelsea manager Jose Mourinho

India v/s Australia 3rd Test Day 4, Melbourne: Australia fightback to pile up 261/7, take lead of 326 runs

South Africa can rip through West Indies batting on day four, claims bowling coach Allan Donald

Ched Evans case: Rape victim's father claims daughter had to change name and shift hose five times post Twitter trolls

ENTERTAINMENT

'Furious' Madonna says 'no one can shut her up'

Chris Rock, wife to divorce after 19 years of marriage

Bigg Boss 8: Ajaz Khan re-enters show as first challenger of new series 'Halla Bol'
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MONEY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rupee pares initial losses, still down 7 paise against dollar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easier entry rules, competitive taxation key to boost manufacturing, says Finance Minister Arun Jaitley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensex surges 265 points in early trade on global trends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rupee extends weakness, down 13 paise against USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing sector could turnaround in 2015 with boost of FDI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>